

Interactive comment on “An overview of underwater sound generated by inter-particle collisions and its application to the measurements of coarse sediment bedload transport” by P. D. Thorne

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 8 August 2014

As far as I can tell, the manuscript is simply a regurgitation of results from Thorne (1985), Thorne (1986), Thorne and Foden (1988), and Thorne et al. (1989). This includes figures that seem self-plagiarized and yet are not even clearly attributed (for every figure that re-plots a figure that has previously been published, I expect a citation in the caption). This is not acceptable, even in a review paper. Unfortunately, this manuscript does not even serve the purpose as a review, since it really only discusses work by the author and his coauthors, and the latest results shown seem to be from 1989, i.e. 25 years ago, with only a handful of the references being to papers written in

C259

the last 10 years. This is simply not acceptable, and should not be published.

To be specific about which criteria of ESurf are not met, the following questions posed by ESurf to reviewers are answered in the negative:

Does the manuscript represent a substantial contribution to scientific progress within the scope of Earth Surface Dynamics? No. Does the paper present novel concepts, ideas, tools, or data? No. Are substantial conclusions reached? No. Do the authors give proper credit to related work and clearly indicate their own new/original contribution? No.

Interactive comment on Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., 2, 605, 2014.

C260