

Interactive comment on “Quantifying the roles of bed rock damage and microclimate on potential soil production rates, erosion rates, and topographic steepness: A case study of the San Gabriel Mountains, California” by Jon D. Pelletier

J. Braun (Editor)

jean.braun@ujf-grenoble.fr

Received and published: 7 October 2016

Reading through the two reviews we have received concerning your manuscript, it is clear that it raises many questions from the reviewers. Their comments and criticisms concern both the methods you have used to interpret the data and the assumptions on which the interpretation is based. At this stage, it is critical that you respond to the second reviewer's comments and criticisms before considering preparing a revised version of the manuscript. It seems to me that both reviewers (or sets of reviewers as both Heimsath and Whipple signed the first review) request major modifications

C1

to the methodology you have used which might strongly impact your conclusions. I look forward to your detailed rebuttal and/or comments following the second reviewer's detailed assessment of your manuscript for which I thank him.

Interactive comment on Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., doi:10.5194/esurf-2016-37, 2016.

C2