

Interactive comment on “Unsupervised detection of salt marsh platforms: a topographic method” by Guillaume C. H. Goodwin et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 18 December 2017

The manuscript describes a new method for the automatic detection of salt marsh platforms and tidal flats making use of Lidar data. I believe that this topic is of general interest in the field. The manuscript is written very well, the objectives are clear, the methodology is described in details, the results are clear and easy to interpret, and the conclusions are presented very well.

My only concern is that the methodology is presented as a general tool for salt marsh and tidal flat identification, while I believe that its application is limited to the specific type of marshes presented in this study. I suggest the authors to 1) better clarify the specs of the methodology that are tightly linked to the morphological characteristics of the specific study sites in order to make aware the user of the limits in applying the methodology; 2) describe in more details the 6 study sites considered in this re-

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



search underlying the specific peculiar morphological characteristics. This will allow the user/reader to decide if the methodology may be applied to a different study site. Moreover, the authors refer to a 20 cm value to be subtracted “to define the minimum local elevation for a platform pixel” (pag. 7 lines 7-8). Also in this case a more precise explanation should be included so that the reader can judge if this is a value typical of the considered study sites or can be generalized.

In summary, I suggest the publication of the manuscript with minor revisions.

Some specific suggestions for the authors are the following:

Pag. 3 lines 20-25: in the text I do not see a description of the gray area in Fig. 3a.

Pag 7 lines 7-10: Is the value 20cm applied to all the study sites? Could you please better explain how this specific value has been selected? is there a relation with the tidal excursion for example? Is this value specific for the English study sites?

Figure 12: the faded lines are difficult to see

Interactive comment on Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2017-60>, 2017.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

