

Interactive comment on “Effect of changing vegetation on denudation (part 1): Predicted vegetation composition and cover over the last 21 thousand years along the Coastal Cordillera of Chile” by Christian Werner et al.

R. Hodge (Editor)

rebecca.hodge@durham.ac.uk

Received and published: 10 May 2018

The reviewers agree that this is a well-executed and well written paper. The two reviewers identify very similar areas that the authors need to address when replying to these reviews. They identify that the main advance of this work is the inclusion of 'landforms' into the dynamic vegetation model, but both think that the effect of this change needs further exploration and more quantitative validation. The reviewers make some suggestions for how this might be undertaken (e.g. further analysis, comparison with literature or additional model runs), and I would encourage the authors to think about

C1

how they can address this.

The overall aim of this pair of papers is to move forwards towards coupling a dynamic vegetation model and a landscape evolution model. This would be a notable advance, however this paper also needs to stand on its own. A more robust analysis of the new landform component of the model would help to achieve this by demonstrating the novelty and significance of this work in its own right, rather than just in the context of the larger project.

Interactive comment on Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2018-14>, 2018.

C2