

Manuscript esurf-2018-22

“Glacial dynamics in Prealpine narrow valleys during the Last Glacial Maximum inferred by lowlands fluvial record (NE Italy)”

by Rossato et al.

Comments on the submitted revised manuscript:

I checked the submitted revised version against my comments to the initial submission in an attempt to judge how the authors responded to them and whether the manuscript has been improved. The initial submission already was an interesting contribution addressing an interesting and important topic.

My first major comment was addressed in satisfactory fashion and by adding some of the potential scenarios I mentioned. It is follow to follow the arguments by the authors that the lack of terminal moraines is likely caused by glaciofluvial erosion rather than by factors linked to different types of moraine formation. I feel that the manuscript has now been improved regarding this aspect especially for readers not familiar with the specific study area.

With my second major comment regarding the potential blockage of glacier flow by narrow gorges has also been addressed in satisfactory fashion. The authors added some explanations and although I am still not entirely convinced to follow the author's conclusions, I am now totally fine in the way they presented them to the reader and see no reasons to request further changes.

Regarding the technical comments I made to the initial submission, I think the new title is much better than the old one and like the change made. I also acknowledge that the authors took my and the comments of the second reviewer on board and revised the manuscript with regards to the use of commas and other linguistic/stylistic flaws that took my attention when reviewing the initial manuscript. Important information about the type of material radiocarbon-dated has now been added and I would like to thank the authors for providing it. As requested, the difference between lodgement and melt-out till has been clarified in the text.

Summarising, I thanks the authors for addressing my comments on the initial manuscript in satisfactory fashion and now rate the revised manuscript as acceptable for publication.