

## ***Interactive comment on “Short communication: The Topographic Analysis Kit (TAK) for TopoToolbox” by Adam M. Forte and Kelin X. Whipple***

**S. Hergarten (Referee)**

stefan.hergarten@geologie.uni-freiburg.de

Received and published: 15 August 2018

In this short communication a software toolbox for performing morphometric analyses is presented. As quantitative geomorphology apparently becomes more and more important for unraveling the geologic history, the need for software implementations accessible without deeper knowledge in programming has increased in the last years. The toolbox presented here can be seen as some kind of front-end for TopoToolbox and provides more functions “coming out of the box” as well as compiled versions that can be used without MATLAB. I am quite sure that the new toolbox will receive considerable interest although there are already several other toolboxes on different levels available.

C1

However, I am not completely convinced that the type of presentation really fits well into Earth Surface Dynamics. The manuscript itself does not contain much information going beyond listing the main capabilities of the toolbox. In turn the supplement (the manual of the software) is rather technical. When I looking at other examples of papers mainly presenting new tools published in ESurf (e.g., TopoToolbox 2 by W. Schwanghart and D. Scherler, the recently published tools for quantification of changing Earth surface margins by J.M. Lea or my own one on swath profiles) I get the impression that these papers have much more focus on the ideas, algorithms, performance and potential limitations of the presented tools.

For this specific field: We know that river profile analysis can be a challenge in detail, smoothing of river profiles is nontrivial, and the interpretation of  $\chi$  maps is also anything but trivial. For a paper (also for a short communication) in ESurf I would expect more information and discussion about the ideas behind the presented toolbox that could indeed make these geomorphic analysis accessible to a larger group of researchers and avoid potential pitfalls. In the present form of the manuscript I would even guess that a note about the availability of the new toolbox and a short presentation of its capabilities on Wolfgang Schwanghart's TopoToolbox web page would do a better job in propagating the software.

---

Interactive comment on Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2018-57>, 2018.

C2