

## ***Interactive comment on “Theoretical Interpretation of the Exceptional Sediment Transport of Fine-grained Dispersal Systems Associated with Bedform Categories” by Tian Zhao et al.***

**E. Lajeunesse (Editor)**

lajeunes@ipgp.fr

Received and published: 12 November 2018

Dear Authors,

We have now received two anonymous reviews of the manuscript "Theoretical Interpretation of the Exceptional Sediment Transport of Fine-grained Dispersal Systems Associated with Bedform Categories". Both reviews identify major issues which make it hard to recommend revisions to the paper. In particular, both reviewers conclude that the manuscript, based solely on empirical correlations, lacks a theoretical framework despite being in the title.

C1

The topic of your manuscript is important – and the physics of bedforms development, and of their influence on the flow, has made tremendous progress over the past few years. Following the reviewers recommendation, I encourage you to reanalyse your data in the light of this work (see, for example, Charru et al. 2013, doi: 10.1146/annurev-fluid-011212-140806; Claudin et al. 2011, doi: 10.1017/S0022112010005823).

To conclude, I share the opinion of the referees that considerably more work and analysis would be required for the present manuscript to be published in E-Surf. Therefore, I recommend you not to proceed with this submission and to withdraw your paper from further processing.

Sincerely yours,

Eric Lajeunesse

---

Interactive comment on Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2018-64>, 2018.

C2