Earth **Surface**
Dynamics
Discussions

ESurfD

Interactive
comment

Interactive comment on "A segmentation approach for the reproducible extraction and quantification of knickpoints from river long profiles" *by* Boris Gailleton et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 13 November 2018

This work presents an improved approach for the extraction and quantification of knickpoints from river long profiles. The work is well written and clear in its goals.

Having said that, in my opinion, there are two major issues to fix before getting it published: (1) the format of the publication that at my eyes is a technical note, not a full paper; (2) representativeness of study area considered in this study and its application in complex geomorphology landscapes.

(1) In the hands of the Esurf editor the decision, but at my eyes, this paper, mainly focused on an improved method, among others available in the literature, should be structured as a technical note.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

(2) I'm not sure, but are the study areas presented, enough to guarantee a robust analysis of the capability of the given method to work objectively in different landscape contexts, and complex morphological conditions? The impression (but maybe I'm wrong) is that the landscape morphology of those areas is quite gentle...

For other points, I'm generally in line with the feedback provided by reviewer #1.