Re-review of 'Acoustic wave propagation in rivers: an experimental study' by Geay et al

The manuscript reports on underwater measurements of ambient acoustic noise levels collected in several shallow rivers in the French Alps. The rational for collecting the data is to improve the measurement of bedload gravel transport, by using passive underwater acoustic monitoring, of the sound radiated by inter-particle impacts of mobile material.

The authors have attended to the specific comments from the first review. As mentioned in the previous review all the results flow from the curve fitting to the data illustrated in figure 5. It is unclear whether the example shown in figure 5 for a 1.0 kHz band in the Leysse river is particularly representative of the whole data set. A figure 5 with subplots showing curve fitting for a number of frequencies would provide the reader with additional evidence of the approach. Further plots in an appendix for three of the rivers at different frequencies representing fits to low (Isere), medium (Leysse) and high (Arve) attenuation would be useful. Alternatively, the authors could make the data forming figure 5 available for all rivers and frequency bands as a supplement to the manuscript. This would allow other interested parties carry out similar analysis.

The data provided is of limited value for improving the detection of bedload transport acoustically owing to the substantial variability in riverine soundscapes. However, as mentioned in the previous review, there are limited studies of ambient acoustical noise levels in rivers and these data provide indicative background sound levels. The authors may be interested in other soundscape studies e.g. Vracar, M. S. and Mijic, M. Ambient noise in large rivers, J. Acoust. Soc. Am., 130, 1787–1791, 2011 and any other publications the authors can find for comparison and provide context for their own study.

The above suggestions are left to editorial discretion as to whether acceptance of the manuscript is contingent on the above additions.