

Interactive comment on “River patterns reveal landscape evolution at the edge of subduction, Marlborough Fault System, New Zealand” by Alison R. Duvall et al.

Jean Braun (Editor)

jean.braun@gfz-potsdam.de

Received and published: 6 September 2019

Reading the two reviews posted so far about this manuscript, I find them very constructive and useful for the authors if they wish to start preparing a revised version. Both reviewers acknowledge that this is an interesting manuscript but that it requires to be improved before publication in ESurf.

In particular, there is a need to expand the description of previous work and its comparison with the results obtained in this paper. This would ensure that the paper is appealing to a broader audience. I thank one of the reviewers for taking the time to provide a very thorough account of previously published work on the tectonic control of

C1

river network geometry.

One of the reviewers also find that the paper needs to be better organized with some of the material describing previous work and the geological setting currently dispersed in various parts of the manuscript needing to be moved in the introduction or just below. Both reviewers also express the concern that it is not clear what is a conclusion or an assumption (similar statements appear in the introduction and the conclusion/discussion sections).

I also agree with one of the reviewers that the methodology used must be greatly improved. As it is, I do not believe that the results obtained here could be easily reproduced with the information provided by the authors.

However, I do not wish to appear too negative about this paper. It reports very interesting results that should definitely be published in ESurf but requires to be presented in a way that makes it of greater general applicability/relevance and is better organized.

The discussion will remain open until the 18th of December in the hope of attracting additional comments and/or criticisms.

Interactive comment on Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2019-41>, 2019.

C2