Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2020-3-AC1, 2020 © Author(s) 2020. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



ESurfD

Interactive comment

Interactive comment on "Scale-breaks of suspended sediment rating in large rivers in Germany induced by organic matter" by Thomas O. Hoffmann et al.

Thomas O. Hoffmann et al.

thomas.hoffmann@bafg.de

Received and published: 20 April 2020

First of all, we thank Kristin Bunte and the anonymous reviewer for their constructive criticism and for taking the time to share their insightful suggestions and comments. Both reviewers do not have a general critic on the manuscript, but made many detailed suggestions how to improve it. Thus, we address their comments in the revised version of the manuscript (including track changes option) and reply to their detailed comments step by step below. We have the feeling that the manuscript greatly improved thanks to the efforts of the reviewers.

Both reviewers raised their concern regarding the description of the methods applied

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



to compute the breakpoint between the low-flow and high-flow. We critically reviewed the methods section with a special emphasis on bootstrapping and sincerely hope that these changes make our manuscript more to the point and easier to follow. Also, we gave more information on why the geometric mean is used for normalization.

Furthermore, we point out that in reaction to the valid criticism raised by Kristin Bunte, we changed large parts of section 4.1 to ensure a better connection between the aspects discussed therein.

We fully agree with reviewer #2 that we used a static approach to analyze the sediment rating. We rephrased the manuscript to clarify this confusion.

All other detailed comments will be addressed in the revised manuscript. A detailed reply can be found in the attached file.

Kind regards

On behalf of all co-authors Thomas Hoffmann

Please also note the supplement to this comment: https://www.earth-surf-dynam-discuss.net/esurf-2020-3/esurf-2020-3-AC1-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2020-3, 2020.

ESurfD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

