

Manuscript number: esurf-2021-17

Authors: Sophie Bodek and Douglas Jerolmack

Title: Breaking down chipping and fragmentation in sediment transport: the control of material strength

Date: 11/4/2021

Responses to associate Editor Comments

Thanks for submitting this revised version, and for your response to the latest review. The main arguments, particularly the difference between chipping and fragmentation, are now clearly presented, and the implications of the paper for a range of Earth surface processes are well laid out. I'm happy to recommend this for publication subject to two very minor edits/suggestions as below.

Figure 5: Define VCM in the caption

The caption has been edited to include the definition of VCM – volume of concrete mix.

Figure 9: Personally I wouldn't use e notation in a publication. I'm not sure whether ESurf has an editorial policy on this. I leave it at the discretion of the authors.

Figure 9 has been revised so that all measurements are written in scientific notation.